Discussant comments:
I will assign you to discuss the written work (based on your reading of the most up-to-date written work prior to the final paper) of one of your colleagues. Your formal written comments should focus on all aspects of the work. Among the issues you should consider are:

- Is the puzzle compelling?
- How well is the literature dealt with?
- How well conceived are the hypotheses?
- Do the hypotheses get at the larger issue (the puzzle) under consideration?
- Do you find the data choices compelling?
- Quality of the writing?
- Other issues?

Format:
- You should submit to me a 2-page version of the memo along with a power point presentation the night before the presentation of the work you discuss.
- And in class, following your colleague’s presentation, you will give a 5 minute presentation that critiques his/her proposal.
- 2 days later, you should resubmit the memo to me and to the person on whose work you commented, along with a 1-2 page addendum in which you discuss:
  1. The main comments made by the rest of the class about the work you commented on, and
  2. How convincingly your colleague addressed your comments and those of the rest of the class.